

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) An ill person

R' Yannai rules that a patient who feels he needs to eat on Yom Kippur is permitted to eat even if the doctor says it is unnecessary.

R' Yannai rules that if the doctor says the patient should eat and the patient says it is unnecessary, the doctor's advice should be followed.

The second ruling is unsuccessfully challenged.

Mar bar R' Ashi rules that if an ill person says he must eat, he may eat even if one hundred doctors say it is unnecessary.

This ruling is unsuccessfully challenged.

2) **MISHNAH:** The Mishnah begins with halachos related to violating Yom Kippur restrictions for a person's health and moves on to the principle that one may violate Shabbos to save a life.

3) Clarifying the Mishnah

A Baraisa explains how we know that a person suffering from bulmos has regained his vision.

A Baraisa teaches that a person suffering from bulmos should be given the least severe forbidden food available.

The Gemara presents a dispute between Tannaim whether, when necessary, one should eat tevel or terumah.

Rabbah qualifies the dispute and explains each Tanna's position.

4) Bulmos

A Baraisa records a treatment for one who is afflicted with bulmos.

Abaye further explains the treatment.

Other bulmos treatments are presented.

Two bulmos related incidents are recorded.

5) Examining names

An incident that involves the practice of some Tannaim who examined names is retold.

6) Mad dog

A Baraisa records five characteristics of a mad dog. Rav and Shmuel dispute what causes a dog to go mad. ■

Gemara GEM

The mad dog and the slanderer

תנו רבנן חמשה דברים נאמרו בכלב שוטה 'כו

In his Sefer Shmiras Halashon (Sha'ar HaZechirah, Ch. 4, notes), R' Yisroel Meir Kagan, zt"l, expounds upon our Gemara using the insight of our sages who compare the habitual speaking and listening to leshon hara to a situation of a mad dog that bites, and that such a wound does not heal.

The Chofetz Chaim elaborates: The Gemara mentions five features in reference to a wild dog. Its mouth is always open, its stench lingers, its tail hangs below its legs, its ears are long and hang low, and it stalks along the edge of the street. Some say that it also barks, but its voice is not heard.

Each of these features can be understood in terms of the comparison which our sages make to one who habitually speaks leshon hara. His mouth is constantly open, indiscriminately ready to share his venomous tales with any person he meets. The one who spreads slander possesses a foul and evil spirit, and his presumptuous nature and angry character cause him to spread an unpleasant aura before himself and to leave behind a foul odor to those he affects.

The other three aspects of a wild dog come from his desire to lurk undetected and to be prepared to pounce upon his unsuspecting victim. His ears are poised to hear the approach of an appropriate target, and his tail is hidden between his legs as he walks along the side of the road to remain out of sight until he is ready to strike. He remains quite careful, so that he will be able to bite without warning.

This is the nature of the slanderer, as he spreads his tales to an unassuming listener. He casually strolls about, and he unleashes his stories and aspersions about people without advance notice.

It is especially necessary for us to identify the nature of those who speak leshon hara in order to protect ourselves from their attack. The danger and devastation of leshon hara can be avoided if we steer clear of it before it happens. ■

HALACHAH Highlight

Non-kosher homeopathic medication

מי שנשכו כלב שוטה אין מאכילין אותו מחצר כבד שלו

If a person is bitten by a mad dog, we do not feed him the [mad dog's] liver lobe.

Rambam¹ explains that Chachamim prohibited, even for medicinal purposes, the consumption of non-kosher food when the curative effects of the medication has no basis in science (סגולית) and has not been tested as an effective cure. Even if there are doctors who praise its therapeutic properties it may not be used if its use would violate a prohibition. Accordingly, there are Poskim² who question whether it is permitted for a person to take homeopathic medications that are or may be non-kosher. One of the components of the question is that in the manufacturing process it is soaked in alcohol and, depending on the place where it is manufactured, it may be a wine derivative.

Rav Shmuel HaLevi Vosner³ addressed the issue of whether homeopathic medication is “natural” (טבעית) and its use would override prohibitions, or if they are not natural, and they may not be used if their use involves violating prohibitions. He writes that the question is not whether a medication is derived from natural ingredients or not; rather the central issue is whether it has been demonstrated as an effective cure. In other words, medications that are made from natural ingredients but have not been tested for effectiveness are considered non-scientific –סגולית–and would be prohibited. Medications that are not natural but have proven to be therapeutic are

REVIEW and Remember

1. What is the verse that indicates that a person is familiar with his own medical condition?

2. In what way is tevel a less severe prohibition than terumah?

3. Which side of a fig tree produces the best tasting figs?

4. What is the significance of examining a person's name?

treated as “natural” –טבעית– and are therefore permitted.

Other Poskim who address this issue also permit the use of homeopathic medication even when all of its ingredients are not known based on principles derived from the halachos of wine that is manufactured by a non-Jew (סתם יינם). ■

1. פירוש משניות פ"ח למס' יומא מ"ד שכתב, "וחכמים אומרים אין עוברין על מצוה אלא ברפוי בלבד שהוא דבר ברור שההגיון והנסיון הפשוט מחייבין אותו אבל הרפוי בסגולית לא לפי שנינים חלוש לא יחייבוהו ההגיון ונסיונו רחוק וכו'."
2. ע' שו"ת מנחת יצחק ח"ח סי' ס"ח ושו"ת שבט הלוי ח"ה סי' נ"ה ושו"ת משנה הלכות ח"י סי' קי"ב ושו"ת בצל החכמה ח"ד סי' קע"ד
3. שו"ת שבה"ל הנ"ל וז"ל, "הנה אמר לנו רבינו מילתא בטעמא, שכללי רפואה גמורה הם שתיים שהוציאו הדעת ור"ל שעצם חכמת הרפואה ולמוד הרפואה צריך שיקבע שהגיון הלב והדעת קובע שכך רפואה זו מועילה למחלה זאת, שנית שנסיון התרופה תהי' אמיתית ור"ל שיש הרבה תרופות שכללי המדע אומרים שהם מרפאים שכל הנסיון במציאות נותן תמונה אחרת וזה כמה פעמים מצד המקבלים כי אין הגופים מקבלים תרופות כאלה, אבל ב' כללים אלה יתכנו בדרך כלל ברפואות טבעיות"
4. שו"ת מנח"י ושו"ת בצל החכמה הנ"ל ■

STORIES Off the Daf

We listen to the doctor

רובא אומר צריך וחולה אומר אינו צריך שומעין לרופי

The Shem MiShmuel, זת"ל, once wrote to his son-in-law Rav Yaakov Tzvi, זת"ל: "I heard from my daughter...that the doctor feels that you are recovering, may Hashem send you a complete recovery. Yom Kippur is approaching and I want to warn you not to act overly righteous by fasting if the doctor tells you to eat. If he says that eating less than a shiur is not poten-

tially dangerous to your health, then do so. If he says that this is not enough for you, God forbid that you should be stringent and endanger yourself. He who commanded us to fast on Yom Kippur commanded us to eat for health reasons. Do not think that only an immediate danger allows one to eat. Even when there is the shadow of a doubt, one must eat... This is the meaning of the Gemara in Yoma: If the sick person says that he doesn't need to eat but the doctor says he does, we listen to the doctor. This is even in the case of a sick person who himself understands the nature of sickness...even if he is a real expert,

we still listen to the doctor.

"I am certain that you recall what you have heard from me many times that the main element of Judaism is to nullify one's own understanding before that of the Torah and the sages. This is true even if they tell you that your left is really your right. This is the most important avodah of a Jew, and by eating as ordered by the doctor you will be doing this distinguished avodah. Therefore you should feel no pain in the event of your having to eat, because in such an eventuality you will actually be doing a more precious avodah than one who fasts!" ■

