

## OVERVIEW of the Daf

### 1) Shemini Atzeres in the Diaspora (cont.)

The Gemara explains that the dispute between Rav and R' Yochanan concerning Shemini Atzeres in the Diaspora applies specifically to the brachah on the sukkah, while both opinions agree that one should sit in the sukkah.

R' Yosef cites support for R' Yochanan's opinion that a brachah should not be recited.

R' Yosef's support is unsuccessfully challenged.

A second version of the qualification is presented where all opinions agree that a brachah is not recited and the dispute is whether one should sit in the sukkah.

The Gemara rules that one should sit in the sukkah without making a brachah.

### 2) Shehecheyanu

R' Yochanan ruled that shehecheyanu is recited on Shemini Atzeres but it is not recited on the seventh day of Pesach.

A proof for this ruling is presented.

The Gemara unsuccessfully attempts to support R' Yochanan's ruling from a Baraisa.

### 3) Staying overnight

The Gemara challenges the earlier assumption that R' Yehudah requires a person to stay overnight after Shemini Atzeres.

The challenge is refuted and the Gemara offers proof that according to R' Yehudah one is required to stay overnight even for events that are not followed by a six-day observance.

The proof is rejected.

### 4) Shehecheyanu (cont.)

R' Nachman ruled that shehecheyanu is recited on Shemini Atzeres whereas R' Sheishes ruled that it should not be recited.

The Gemara rules that we do recite shehecheyanu, and begins to cite a Baraisa in support of this opinion of R' Nachman. ■

## Distinctive INSIGHT

*Observances of Shemini Atzeres, and Tefillin on Yom Tov Sheni*

והלכתא מיתבינן יתבינן ברוכי לא מברכינן

The Gemara analyzes various options regarding dwelling in a sukkah on Shemini Atzeres. On the one hand, Sukkos is over and the mitzvah of dwelling in a sukkah is no longer in effect. In fact, if a person enters a sukkah and pronounces a brachah, he would be in violation of **בל תוסיף**. On the other hand, we observe each day of Sukkos with a degree of uncertainty of the calendar—**ספיקא דיומא**. Shemini Atzeres must be treated as if it was possibly the seventh day, which is still Sukkos. Accordingly, sitting in a sukkah is appropriate. The conclusion of the Gemara is that we sit in a sukkah, but no brachah upon the mitzvah is said.

Rosh (ס"מ ה', end) writes that we do not pronounce a brachah upon entering a sukkah on Shemini Atzeres because doing so would be a demonstration of contradictory behavior. If we are declaring our being in a sukkah as a mitzvah, it cannot be Shemini Atzeres. And if it is Shemini Atzeres, and Sukkos is over, then our entering into a sukkah cannot be a mitzvah. Simply entering a sukkah without reciting a brachah is not inconsistent with it being Shemini Atzeres, because people occasionally eat outdoors if they feel that it is pleasant for them. Our sages did not enact to take lulav on Shemini Atzeres without a brachah, because this is not an activity which people do on their own, and taking it would be an overt sign of our denying that the day is Shemini Atzeres. Tosafos (ד"ה מיתב) adds that taking lulav would involve handling what may be muktzah on Yom Tov.

Ritva points out that not only can entering a sukkah be interpreted as an elective activity, rather than a violation of Shemini Atzeres, but the fact that we do not recite a brachah is also a demonstration that we are only dwelling in the sukkah due to our uncertainty about the calendar date, and it therefore does not undermine the kedushah of the Yom Tov.

Ksav Sofer (ש"ת אר"ח סי' י') asks that according to Ritva, we should don Tefillin on the second day of Yom Tov in **חוץ לארץ** and not recite a brachah. Our omitting the brachah would indicate that we are doing so due to our doubt, and it would not violate the kedushah of the Yom Tov. According to Rosh this is not a problem, because donning Tefillin is in and of itself a weekday activity, and it is not allowed.

Ksav Sofer answers that even Ritva agrees we do not wear Tefillin on **יום טוב שני**, because people would view the second day of observance cheaply, which would be in contrast to the first day Yom Tov when we do not wear Tefillin. ■

# HALACHAH Highlight

## *Sitting in the Sukkah on Shemini Atzeres in Chutz La'Aretz* והלכתא מיתב יתבינן ברוכי לא מברכינן

And the halachah is that we sit in the sukkah [on Shemini Atzeres in chutz la'aretz] but we do not make the brachah.

Although the Gemara uses language that indicates that one should eat and sleep in the sukkah on Shmini Atzeres, nonetheless, Maharil<sup>1</sup> rules that eating should be in the sukkah but one sleeping should be in the house. The reason for this ruling is that normally one makes a brachah when eating in the sukkah, and by not making a brachah on Shmini Atzeres one demonstrates, in a discernable way, that one does not intend to add to the mitzvah. On the other hand, people do not make a brachah for sleeping in the sukkah, therefore, if one were to sleep in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres it would not be discernable that one does not intend to add to the mitzvah. Shulchan Aruch<sup>2</sup> records the ruling of the Gemara that one should eat the meals in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres without reciting the brachah and Mishnah Berurah<sup>3</sup> records the qualification of Maharil that one should not sleep in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres.

Notwithstanding the above there are many people, most prominently Chassidim, who have alternative customs regarding the use of the sukkah on Shmini Atzeres. Some do not sit in the sukkah at all, others eat only lunch in the sukkah and some would only make Kiddush and eat some cake in the sukkah during the day and eat the remainder of the meal inside. Many explanations have been suggested to explain the different customs and in fact, Rav Tzadok HaKohen of Lublin wrote an entire sefer

# REVIEW and Remember

1. What is the Gemara's conclusion regarding sitting in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres?
2. Why do we say shehecheyanu on Shemini Atzeres?
3. If a person did not make shehecheyanu on the first day of Yom Tov can it be recited on another day?
4. What is the mitzvah of לינה?

(משיב צדק) on the topic. Rav Yechiel Michal Epstein<sup>4</sup> offers the following explanation to explain, in general terms, this custom. The reason it is permitted to sit in the sukkah on Shmini Atzeres without regard to the prohibition against adding to the Torah is that people occasionally eat outside simply because it is pleasant to sit outside. In cold countries, however, this claim does not stand because it is too cold to eat outside comfortably. Thus, different practices developed to avoid the appearance of adding to the Torah. ■

1. מנהגי מהרי"ל הל' חג הסוכות אות ג'
2. שלחן ערוך אר"ח סי' תרס"ח סע' א'
3. משנה ברורה שם סק"ו וא"ש שמביא פוסקים שחולקים וס"ל דכיון דהגמ' לא חילק בן אכילה ובין שינה חייב לישן בסוכה בשמיני עצרת וכן דעת הגר"א (מעשה רב אות רט"ז)
4. ערוה"ש סי' תרס"ח סע' ד' וה' ■

# STORIES Off the Daf

## *Shemini Atzeres and the Sukkah* והלכתא מיתב יתבינן

We find on today's daf a discussion relating to sitting in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres. Once, the disciples of the Yehudi HaKadosh, ז"ל, (who had himself been a disciple of the Chozeh of Lublin, ז"ל) and the followers of the Chozeh of Lublin engaged in a similar dispute. The clear practice of the Chozeh of Lublin was to return inside his house on Shemini Atzeres, and his students therefore felt justified in doing the same. The Yehudi HaKadosh, on the other hand, always ate in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres, but his practice was open to different interpretations.

Because the Yehudi HaKadosh took his meals in an enclosed porch all year long which served as his sukkah during the holiday after the roof was removed, it could not be said with great certainty whether he really meant to eat in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres, or was simply eating in the room of the house where he normally ate.

The students of the Chozeh were indignant that the Yehudi meant to eat in the sukkah and was departing from his own, and their, Rebbe's custom, while the Yehudi's own followers maintained that he meant to eat in the house, and did not disagree with his own Rebbe at all. But the Chozeh's students pursued the conflict and reasoned, "If he really wanted to 'return to the house' he should have ordered the roof closed!"

Rav Chaim Meir Yechiel Shapira of Mogelnitz, ז"ל, once commented on this particular machlokes: "Whatever they do has a halachic basis, so the main thing in such an instance is to avoid the fruitless arguing that leads to שנאת חנם."

The Vilna Gaon, ז"ל, held that our Gemara is conclusive regarding dwelling (and sleeping) in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres. Once, it turned bitterly cold on Shemini Atzeres, but the Gaon insisted on proper fulfillment of the halachah.

He said, "Although it is extremely cold and we are not obligated to sleep in the sukkah, let us bundle up very well to make sure that we will not feel discomfort and we can sleep there anyway. That way, we will provide a living example that one is also obligated to sleep in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres in לחץ לארץ!" ■

