

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) Deconsecrating shemittah produce (cont.)

Rava explains the dispute between R' Meir and Chachamim mentioned in the Baraisa cited in support of R' Yochanan's opinion regarding the deconsecration of shemittah produce.

R' Ashi qualifies the dispute between R' Elazar and R' Yochanan, regarding the question of whether shemittah produce can be deconsecrated by way of redemption (חילול).

Ravina successfully challenges R' Ashi's explanation and forces him to offer an alternative explanation.

R' Ashi proves that his new interpretation of the Baraisa is correct.

2) **MISHNAH:** The Mishnah outlines the mitzvah of taking the lulav and esrog. Two enactments of R' Yochanan ben Zakkai following the destruction of the Beis HaMikdash are presented.

3) זכר לחורבן

The source for making enactments to remember the destruction of the Beis HaMikdash is identified. Two explanations are presented to explain why R' Yochanan ben Zakkai instituted that new grain is prohibited the entire day of the sixteenth of Nissan.

The Gemara unsuccessfully challenges R' Nachman bar Yitzchok's explanation.

4) **MISHNAH:** The Mishnah presents a description of the process of taking the lulav in the Beis HaMikdash when the first day of Sukkos coincided with Shabbos. R' Yosi discusses the halacha of one who inadvertently transports a lulav from one domain to another.

5) Fulfilling the mitzvah with someone else's lulav

A Baraisa is cited that identifies the source of the halachah that one does not fulfill the mitzvah with another's lulav. A related incident is recorded.

Two parts of the Baraisa are explained.

6) Holding the lulav

It is reported that Ameimar would hold his lulav while davening.

The practice is unsuccessfully challenged from a Baraisa that prohibits holding objects while davening.

A Baraisa is cited that supports the practice. ■

Distinctive INSIGHT

The various תקנות of Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai

משחרב בית המקדש התקין ריב"ז שהיא לולב ניטל במדינה שבעה

After the destruction of the Beis HaMikdash, Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai decreed that the four species should be taken in all places on all seven days (as is the custom today) to keep the memories of our Mikdash alive.

The Mishnah also mentions that Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai made another decree. The prohibition of eating חדש (new grain) would usually be lifted once the Omer offering was brought on the 16th of Nissan. In the absence of the Beis HaMikdash and the Korban Omer, חדש is permitted first thing in the morning. Nevertheless, a decree was made that the new grain would still be prohibited throughout the entire 16th day of Nissan.

Tosafos raises an inquiry. There were many תקנות - enactments - instituted by Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai. Why does the Mishnah mention this particular ruling of prohibiting חדש the entire day of the 16th after discussing the תקנה of taking the four species for all seven days? Additionally, it must be noted that when the Gemara in Masseches Menachos (68a) discusses the decree of Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai regarding חדש, it makes no mention of the תקנה to take the lulav for the entire seven days.

Sfas Emes notes that the answer to this question reveals the sensitivity of our great sages to the sentiments of our people as we yearn for the rebuilding of the Beis HaMikdash. The reason for the enactment to take the four species for a full seven days is to remind us of the way the mitzvah was done when our Temple stood. This could lead the masses to think that steps were being taken to preserve this memory because it would be a very long time until they would once again relive the practices of those golden ages.

To revive the spark of hope that the Temple will be built very soon, we mention the prohibition of חדש the entire day of the 16th of Nissan. As we mentioned, in the absence of the Mikdash, the new grain should be permitted first thing in the morning since the עומר was not to be brought that day. But since the Beis HaMikdash may be built at any moment, thus requiring the Korban Omer to be brought before partaking of the new grain, we abstain from חדש that entire day. The mention of this enactment brings renewed hope that we are confident that very soon our Temple and our pride will be restored. The Gemara in Menachos, however, discusses the prohibition of חדש, which shows confidence in the speedy renewal of the service of the Beis HaMikdash. There is no need to mention the other enactment of Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai.

May we each be זוכה to share that ultimate simchah in our days! ■

HALACHAH Highlight

Taking the Lulav in Yerushalayim

בראשונה היה לולב ניטל במקדש שבעה ובמדינה יום אחד

Originally the lulav was taken in the Mikdash for seven days and in the country (מדינה) one day.

Rashi and Rambam dispute the meaning of the terms "Mikdash" and "מדינה." According to Rashi¹ "Mikdash" refers to the Beis HaMikdash and מדינה includes Yerushalayim and beyond. Rambam², however, includes the entire city of Yerushalayim as part of "Mikdash" and מדינה includes the entire country except for Yerushalayim.

Rav Yaakov Ettliger³ writes that according to Rambam the Biblical commandment to take the lulav for seven days would be in force since the majority of Poskim maintain that the sanctity of Yerushalayim remains even after the destruction of the Beis HaMikdash. Thus, not only is there a mitzvah to take the lulav for seven days, but all the disqualifications that are relaxed outside of the "Mikdash" after the first day would be in force in Yerushalayim for all seven days. For example, in Yerushalayim a person should own, rather than borrow, a lulav and esrog for all seven days.

Rav Eliezer Yehudah Waldenberg⁴ cites a number of Poskim who dispute the assertion of Rav Ettliger and he proceeds to offer his own refutation. Even if we accept that halachah follows Rambam and the mitzvah is to take the lulav in Yerushalayim for all seven days, nonetheless, the mitzvah will only apply when the Beis HaMikdash is extant. Proof to this

REVIEW and Remember

1. What two enactments did R' Yochanan ben Zakkai introduce following the destruction of the Beis HaMikdash?
2. What is the source to make enactments as a remembrance of the Beis HaMikdash?
3. Why was it necessary to arrange all the lulavim in the Beis HaMikdash?
4. Why did R' Gamliel spend so much money for a lulav?

assertion can be inferred from Rambam's ruling regarding the confession recited at the time one brings ma'aser sheni to Yerushalayim. Rambam writes⁵ that the mitzvah is to recite the confession in the Beis HaMikdash because the Torah uses the words 'לפני ה'. These same words teach that there is a mitzvah to take the lulav all seven days in the Beis HaMikdash ושמתם לפני ה' א-לוקיכם שבעת הימים. It is therefore logical to assume, concludes Rav Waldenberg, that the Biblical commandment to take the lulav for all seven days is only in force when the Beis HaMikdash is standing. ■

1. ד"ה במדינה
2. פירוש למשניות סוכה פ"ג מ"א
3. ביכורי יעקב סי' תרנ"ח סק"א וע"ש שהאריך
4. שו"ת ציץ אליעזר ח"י סי' ב' אות י' עד הסוף
5. פי"א מהל' מע"ש ונטע רבעי ה"ו ■

STORIES Off the Daf

The Thousand-Zuz Lulav

ולא היה לולב אלא לרבן גמליאל בלבד שלקחו באלף זוז...להודיעך כמה מצות חביבות עליהן

On today's daf, the Gemara recounts how Rabban Gamliel bought a lulav for a thousand zuz in order to teach us an important lesson: how precious the mitzvos are to the Jewish people.

One year, just before Sukkos, not a single esrog was to be found in all of Berditchev. Rav Levi Yitzchak, zt"l, established a twenty-four hour watch along the roads to stop travelers who might have an esrog to sell. Eventually one was found, but the man was just passing by on his return journey to his far-off home town

and wouldn't be parted from his esrog for anything.

After much urging, the stranger agreed to meet with the famous Rav Levi Yitzchak, who begged him to remain in Berditchev for Sukkos in exchange for any price he cared to name.

The man demurred, "I have everything I need, and I miss my family."

The Rav kept on trying to convince the man to stay, without success. Finally, he blurted out, "If you stay here for yom tov, I promise that you will be with me in the next world!" At last, an offer that the man couldn't refuse!

On the first night of Sukkos, the Rav ordered that no one allow this man to enter any sukkah in town. Even when he started to plead with the townspeople, he

was firmly refused.

He approached Rav Levi Yitzchak himself. "Why are you keeping me out of the sukkah?" he demanded.

"If you release me from my promise, I will let you have the mitzvah of sukkah."

The man was at a loss. On the one hand, he didn't want to relinquish the promise. But on the other, how could he not sit in the sukkah as Hashem commanded? After some deliberation, he agreed to release the Rav from his vow.

After yom tov, the Rav summoned him. "My precious son, I couldn't bear for you to earn your place in עולם הבא just by trading. I had to challenge you a little. Now that you have shown self-sacrifice for a mitzvah, however, you have truly earned it. It's yours!" ■

