

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) **MISHNAH:** The Mishnah enumerates certain properties that could invalidate a sukkah.

2) Clarifying the Mishnah

It is noted that our Mishnah simply declares certain properties as invalid whereas a Mishnah in Eruvin included instructions how to fix the problem; the Gemara wonders why the Mishnayos take these different approaches.

Two solutions to this question are presented.

3) A sukkah higher than twenty amos

The Gemara asks for a source for the Mishnah's ruling that a sukkah higher than twenty amos is invalid.

Three sources are found by Rabbah, R' Zeira and Rava.

Abaye unsuccessfully challenges R' Zeira and Rava as they present their sources.

The shortcoming of each source is identified.

The statements of three Amoraim, R' Yoshiyah, R' Huna and R' Chanan bar Rabbah in the name of Rav, are cited to clarify the dispute in the Mishnah concerning a sukkah higher than twenty amos and the Gemara explains how each statement will or will not fit with the opinions of Rabbah, R' Zeira and Rava.

The Gemara analyzes the dispute between R' Yoshiyah, R' Huna and R' Chanan bar Rabbah as to why a sukkah higher than twenty amos is invalid.

A Baraisa is cited that will be used to formulate a challenge against two of these opinions. ■

REVIEW and Remember

1. What are the three reasons given to explain why a sukkah invalid above twenty amos?

2. How does the height of the sukkah relate to its status as temporary?

3. Under what circumstance would a sukkah remain even if it is higher than twenty amos?

4. Why did Rabanan reject R' Yehudah's proof from the incident of Helena the Queen?

Distinctive INSIGHT

20 Amos—within one's sight

סוכה שהיא גבוהה למעלה מעשרים אמה פסולה

According to Rabbah, the height of a sukkah, as well as the height of a pole of a mavoi, is limited in order that the סכך and the קורה be clearly noticeable to the eye.

Rashi to Bamidbar 9:19 describes the movement of the Clouds of Glory in the desert. When the Jews camped, it sheltered them like a sukkah, and when they set out to travel, the clouds folded over and hovered over the tribe of Yehuda like a pole. Why does Rashi refer to the position of the clouds in terms of a sukkah and a pole?

Sefer Daf al HaDaf cites אמר וללוי who points out that we see in our Gemara that both a sukkah and a pole for a mavoi are items which are directly visible and placed before us to always be aware of them. The Torah teaches that wherever and whenever the Jews traveled in the desert, they were aware that Hashem was guiding them and leading them every step of the way. Massechtos Sukkah and Eiruvim begin with this halachah of keeping these mitzvos well within our view, as we set out to remain focused and alert to the significance of the lessons they teach.

The verse (Bemidbar 14:14) states: אשר עין בעין נראה אתה 'ה- Hashem's eye is upon us, and He protects us. This is a condition we earn with our constant acknowledgment of His presence, as the verse continues: וענך עומד עליהם - as long as we keep the cloud of Hashem before us. ■

Daf DIAGRAM

כדי ראשו ורובו ושולחנו

A sukkah which is seven tefachim by seven tefachim is large enough to contain a person's head and most of his body, and also his table (א). The person fits in an area of 6 by 6 tefachim, and the extra tefach is needed for the table. Magen Avraham explains that according to Rashi, the reason we need a sukkah of seven by seven (and not just 6 x 7) is that the person ate in a reclined position, thus requiring that the sukkah be a bit larger. (See שער הציון תרל"ד ס"ק א' ■)



HALACHAH Highlight

סוכה higher than twenty amos

סוכה שהיא גבוהה למעלה מעשרים אמה פסולה

A sukkah that is higher than twenty amos is invalid

All poskim agree that a sukkah higher than twenty amos is invalid. There is, however, a dispute regarding the status of סוכה that rests higher than twenty amos. Rabbeinu Asher¹ cites the opinion of Rabbeinu Yeshayah who writes that סוכה that sits higher than twenty amos is considered invalid סוכה similar to metal bars. Rabbeinu Tam², on the other hand, disagrees and rules that סוכה higher than twenty amos is not treated as invalid סוכה since its disqualification is a function of its placement.

This dispute has a number of ramifications for other cases³. One example would be a case of one sukkah constructed on top of another. Shulchan Aruch⁴ rules that if the lower סוכה produces its own shade but is not strong enough to support the upper sukkah the lower sukkah is valid even if the upper סוכה is higher than twenty amos. Commentators⁵ question why the upper level of סוכה, that

is higher than twenty amos, does not disqualify the lower level of סוכה? Normally disqualified סוכה invalidates kosher סוכה so why doesn't that happen in this case? Rav Shneur Zalman of Liadi⁶ explains that invalid סוכה will disqualify other סוכה only when it is disqualified by virtue of itself, e.g., branches attached to the ground, or something which is susceptible to tum'ah. If, however, something is not disqualified by virtue of itself but is disqualified because of its circumstance, e.g., סוכה that is higher than twenty amos, it does not disqualify סוכה that is beneath it. This ruling follows the lenient opinion of Rabbeinu Tam,⁷ but according to Rabbeinu Yeshayah the upper level of סוכה would in fact disqualify the lower level of סוכה that is beneath it. ■

1. רא"ש פ"א סי' ג' מביא ב' הדעות
2. מובא דבריו בדתוס' לקמן ט: ד"ה והא
3. ע"ע חידושי רע"א לשו"ע סי' תרכ"ח סע' א' שכתב דסוכה למעלה מכ' נידון משום פסול היוצא מן הסוכה (שו"ע סי' תרל"ג סע' ה') משא"כ סוכה שנפסל משום תעשה ולא מן עשוי. מובא דבריו בשעה"צ סק"ח. וע' בספר הסוכה השלם מילואים לפ"ה אות י"א
4. שו"ע או"ח סי' תרכ"ח סע' א'
5. ע"ש במג"א סק"ב וט"ז סק"ב ודבריהם מובא במ"ב שם סק"ח ושעה"ט שם סק"ח
6. שו"ע הרב שם סע' ב'
7. ע' בביאור הגר"א ועטרת זקנים ועוד ■

STORIES Off the Daf

Feeling the presence of the king

צא מדירת קבע ושב בדירת עראי

The Mei HaShiloach, זת"ל, explains that the true meaning of the mitzvah of sukkah is to “leave one’s permanent dwelling and reside in a temporary one.” We must leave behind our natural tendency to think that the physical world is an independent and fixed reality (קבע) and realize instead that it is just a transient (עראי) mask that conceals Hashem’s presence. This is not a mere intellectual exercise; we must feel that each new moment of existence for every single creation emanates directly from Hashem. This is the foundation of all Divine service: שויתיה ה' לנגדי תמיד.

During his younger years, the Beis

HaLevi, זת"ל, learned in a designated room in his father-in-law’s house. His father-in-law, a chossid of Rav Moshe of Kovrin, זת"ל, had agreed at the beginning of their relationship that he would never disturb his son-in-law’s study for any reason whatsoever.

Once, Rav Moshe came to visit at his follower’s home. Although the Beis HaLevi’s father-in-law wanted his Rebbe to meet his son-in-law, he couldn’t see how it would be possible to introduce them since this would mean interrupting his constant learning. On the day his Rebbe was going to leave he had an idea. He couldn’t interrupt his son-in-law...but someone else could! When he noticed that the Beis HaLevi had left his room for a moment, he placed Rav Moshe’s luggage inside. When the Beis HaLevi returned and resumed his study, the Rebbe knocked at the door.

“What do you want?” the Beis Halevi asked.

“My bags are here. May I come in?”

The Beis HaLevi was just then learning the final section of Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim. Rav Moshe asked, “What about the first subsection? Do you manage to fulfill it?”

The Beis HaLevi answered, “I work on לנגדי ה' fifteen times a day. But I’m always troubled that although the Rema says that imagining being in the all-knowing presence of the King immediately fills a person with fear, it takes me time to feel it.”

The Rebbe explained, “That is because you are thinking with your head. Fear of Heaven is in one’s heart, and it takes time to reach from your head to your heart. That’s why the Rema says to ‘place it on his heart’—not ‘on his head!’” ■

