



# OVERVIEW of the Daf

## 1) Is thought the same as articulation? (cont.)

The gemara concludes its discussion of the opinion Rav Chisda who maintains that thought is not the equivalent as articulation and the reason a baal keri should think birkas hamazon and krias sh'ma is because they are from the Torah.

## 2) Sources for the obligation to make a brocha on Torah and food

Rav Yehudah identifies the source for making a brocha after eating and a brocha before learning.

R. Yochanan suggests that with a kal v'chomer there should be a Torah obligation to make a brocha before eating and after learning but the gemara demonstrates that there is no such obligation.

## 3) Issues related to doubtful recitations

R. Yehudah holds that where one is uncertain if they recited krias shema they do not recite it again whereas by the brocha it would be recited again.

R. Elazar holds that where one is uncertain if they recited krias shema it should be repeated but if one is uncertain whether they said shemoneh esrei it should not be repeated.

R. Yochanan disagrees and maintains that even shemoneh esrei should be repeated.

## 4) Two statements from Shmuel regarding davening an extra shemoneh esrei

If one is saying shemoneh esrei and they realize that they already davened they should stop even in the middle of a brocha.

If one already davened and they enter a shul where people are davening if they can not add something new they should not say another shemoneh esrei.

The gemara explains why both statements are necessary.

## 5) Beginning Shemoneh esrei late

Rav Huna holds that one could begin shemoneh esrei even if they will not finish by kedusha because kedusha could be recited by oneself. If one will not finish by modim they may not begin.

R. Yehoshua ben Levi holds that one should not begin shmoneh esrei if they will not finish by kedusha because according to R. Yehoshua ben Levi kedusha may not be recited by oneself.

The gemara questions interrupting shmoneh esrei for the recitation of "יהא שמו הגדול מבורך" and the conclusion is that one does not interrupt.

## 6) Clarification of R. Yehudah's opinion regarding a baal ker

The gemara explains that R. Yehudah permits a baal ker to recite brachos because he uses the source for the prohibition for a different drosha.

R. Yehudah's position as we presently understand it is questioned from a later Mishnah which demonstrates that even according to R. Yehudah a baal ker should not make brachos. ■

# Distinctive INSIGHT

## To Interrupt During Prayer

מהו להפסיק ליהא שמו הגדול מבורך

A person may not interrupt to answer קדושה or מודים דרבנן while in the middle of shmoneh esrei. Yet, the Gemara asks whether one may interrupt at that point to answer יהא שמייה רבה. The answer reported by R' Dimi is that it is permitted to respond to יהא שמייה רבה, because, he explains, one may even interrupt if he is immersed in the study of מעשה מרכבה.

The Gemara concludes, however, that the halacha is not according to the statement of R' Dimi. שלייה understands the Gemara to mean that the halacha does not accord with R' Dimi on either account. We cannot interrupt during שמו"ע nor during the study of the מרכבה to answer יהא שמייה רבה. Mateh Moshe (#66) however, understands that although it is true that we are not allowed to interrupt עשרה, but someone immersed in מעשה מרכבה can stop and call out יהא שמייה רבה.

According to Mateh Moshe, the Gemara argues with R' Dimi on two points. First of all, we do not allow one to interrupt שמונה עשרה to say יהא שמייה רבה. Secondly, R' Dimi assumed that disrupting מעשה מרכבה is more severe than interrupting during שמונה עשרה. We hold the opposite, and that one may interrupt the study of esoteric and mystical topics to respond and call out יהא שמייה רבה, but it is not allowed to do so while in the middle of one's שמונה עשרה. ■

# Gemara GEM

## The Basis of Prayer: Rambam and Ramban

אלא קריאת שמע וברכת המזון דאורייתא ותפילה דרבנן

There is a famous discussion among the Rishonim regarding the nature of the obligation we to daven.

Ramban (Sefer HaMitzvos #5) writes that the basic mitzvah to daven is only rabbinic. This is also the opinion of most poskim. Rambam writes that the obligation to daven is a Torah-level mitzvah, but the precise times and the exact words which we use are rabbinic guidelines. Some understand that, according to Rambam, the basic structure of our daily amidah, with the praises of Hashem placed first, followed by our personal needs and concluding with gratitude,

(Continued on page 2)

Today's Daf Digest is dedicated  
by the Goldfeder and Teichman families  
in honor of the birthday of Gershon Bassman

Today's Daf Digest is dedicated  
By Rabbi & Mrs. Yehoshua Starr  
לע"נ ר' בנימין בן ר' זעליג ע"ה

Today's Daf Digest is dedicated  
לע"נ מורינו הרב שמשון בן ר' רפאל זצוק"ל

Today's Daf Digest is dedicated  
By the Langsner family  
in loving memory of their grandmother  
Mrs. Chana Robinson o'h  
מרת חנה בת ר' שלום, ע"ה

# HALACHAH Highlight

## Kedushah With A Minyan

וכן אמר רב אדא בר אהבה: מנין שאין היחיד אומר קדושה – שנאמר (ויקרא כב, לב) ונקדשתי בתוך בני ישראל – כל דבר שבקדושה לא יהא פחות מעשרה

"Rav Ada bar Ahava similarly said: From where do we derive that an individual may not say Kedushah in the absence of a quorum? We learn it from the verse: 'And I will be sanctified amongst the Jewish people'. All matters of holiness (הקדושה) may not be recited with less than ten people."

There are three points in davening when Kedushah is recited: 1) Kedushah in Yotzar Ohr 2 (קדושת יוצר) Kedushah in the repetition of the Amidah, and 3) Kedushah in U'Va LiTzion (קדושה דסדרא). The Poskim disagree in defining the Kedushah that one may not say without a minyan. There is consensus that the Kedushah of the repetition of the Amidah must be said with a minyan. The points in contention are the Kedushah of Yotzar and the Kedushah of U'Va LiTzion. Some<sup>1</sup> hold that this limitation applies to each time Kedushah is said, and therefore an individual not praying with a minyan would be required to skip these points. Others<sup>2</sup> hold that this restriction applies only to the Kedushah recited during the repetition of the Amidah. Some<sup>3</sup> distinguish between the Kedushah of Yotzar that may not be said by the individual, and the Kedushah of U'Va LiTzion that may. Some<sup>4</sup> say that the individual may always say the Kedushah if it is recited as one reads the Scripture with the appropriate cantillation (טעמים).

The Shulchan Aruch<sup>5</sup> presents two views: that Kedushah of Yotzar may and may not be said by the individual. He concludes by stating that one should respect the view that Kedushah not be said by an individual, and therefore the individual should say the Kedushah of Yotzar with cantillation (טעמים). The Rema<sup>6</sup> states that the prevalent custom is that the individual does say the Kedushah of Yotzar alone. However, the Mishneh Berura<sup>7</sup> states that preferably an individual should try to say the Kedushah of Yotzar with cantillation (טעמים). ■

1. שבלי הלקט (סיי יג) בשם קדמונים רבים. סי' המנהיג (סיי לא, עמי סג וסיי עו, עמי קו), שו"ת הרשב"א (ח"ה סי' טי). ועיי' ח"א סי' זי).
2. תלמידי רבינו יונה (כאן, דף יג ע"א בדפי הרי"ף) בשם רבנו צרפת ומקצת הגאונים, ושכן נוטה דעת רבינו יונה. רא"ש (פי"ג ס"ס יח ומגילה פי"ג ס"ס זי), והמאירי (ברכות כא ע"ב ועיי' מגילה כג ע"ב), וכן נראה דעת הטור (סי' ט).

# REVIEW and Remember

1. What is the source for making a brocha before studying Torah?
2. Why is krias shema a better way to fulfill zechiras yetzias mitzrayim than the brocha following shema?
3. How do we know that devarim sheb'kedusha require a minyan?
4. What two drashos did R' Yehoshua ben Levi make from the juxtaposition of the pesukim about teaching children and the event of ma'amad har Sinai?

(Overview...continued from page 1)

is also Torah legislated. Even according to Rambam, the Torah obligation can be discharged once daily, and the elaboration and complete arrangement to daven three times each day is rabbinic.

One of the major proofs for Ramban is our Gemara, where a ba'al keris cannot daven even with הרהור as he is allowed to do by sh'ma and birkas hamazon, which are Torah level obligations. Obviously, Ramban claims, we see that prayer is only rabbinic. Magen Avraham (101:#2) explains that Rambam would say that even though prayer is mid'oraisa, a ba'al keris could fulfill his obligation as he reviews birkas hamazon, which has praises and requests contained within it. This is why the Gemara does not entertain the possibility of a ba'al keris davening by hirhur.

Reb Chaim (on Rambam, Hilchos Tefilla 4:1) explains that even according to Ramban who holds that the obligation (חיוב) to daven in the first place is only a rabbinic requirement, however, when one prays, he is definitely fulfilling (קיום) a Torah mitzvah. ■

3. ר"ן (מגילה כג ע"ב, דף יג ע"ב בדפי הרי"ף ד"ה שמעין), ובפירוש ריב"ן (ברכות מה ע"ב, עמי קעו בדפח"ס)
4. שו"ת ר"י מגאש (סיי קלא) ושו"ת תרומת הדשן (סיי ח). ועיי' בשו"ת הרשב"א ח"א (סיי ז) וח"ה (סיי טי) שיושבים בסת"ר. ועיי' ישוב בהערות במהדי' מכון ירושלים ח"ה שם.
5. סיי נט ס"ג
6. שם
7. שם ס"ק יא ■

# STORIES Off the Daf

## Timeless Torah

ברכת התורה לפניך ולאחריה

HaGaon Rabbi Elazar Man Schach, zt"l once mentioned to a group of his close talmidim that he was always bothered by a question of the Pnei Yehoshua, but he was not sure whether they would be bothered by the same problem. The students wondered if they could come up with an answer to the

question, but HaRav Schach repeated that it was the question that bothered him, not the answer.

When their curiosity had peaked, the Rosh HaYeshiva asked them the query. The Gemara says that there is a bracha to be said before one learns Torah, and there is also discussion about the blessing to be recited upon finishing learning. Now, regarding saying a bracha beforehand, we can certainly understand that this is reasonable. However, asks the Pnei Yeshoshua, what is the situation where one has finished learning? The obliga-

tion to learn is day and night, and there is no time in one's entire life when one can claim that his learning has come to an end!

"Now," concluded HaRav Schach, "many of you watch the clock, and when the study period is over, you close your Gemara. That is when the learning has ended. The Torah of a true ben-Torah, however, is not fixed by the clock. He is immersed and driven to climb the ladder of ascent and growth as a life goal. For him, there is no moment when the bracha after learning can apply. This is the question of the Pnei Yehoshua." ■