

Daf Digest for this month is dedicated in memory of רבקה יענטא (Babby Weiss) בת ר' אשר אנטשיל ע"ה

By the Weiss brothers –London, Staten Island, Yerushalayim

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) The story of R' Gamliel and R' Yehoshua (cont.)

The Gemara continues the story of R' Gamliel and R' Yehoshua. The Chachamim decided to appoint R' Elazar b. Azarya as the Nasi. After R' Gamliel and R' Yehoshua make peace the Chachamim develop a system to allow both R' Gamliel and R' Elazar b. Azarya to share the position of Nasi.

2) Issues related to davening musaf

R' Yochanan refers to a person who delays davening musaf until late in the day as a negligent person.

There is a disagreement in the Beraisa whether, when faced with the choice, one should daven musaf and then mincha, or mincha and then musaf. R' Yochanan rules according to the opinion that says one should daven mincha first.

3) Davening late

The Gemara cites two statements related to davening after the ideal time and the criticism R' Yehudah would have for such a person.

4) Eating before musaf and mincha

After telling the story of R' Avya being too ill to attend R' Yosef's shiur, the Gemara tells us that we do not follow the opinions that state that it is prohibited to eat before davening mincha or musaf.

5) MISHNAH: R' Nechunya ben HaKaneh said a special tefilla on his way in and out of the beis midrash.

6) R' Nechunya ben HaKaneh's tefilla is spelled out.

7) Two stories are told of Tannaim and their deathbed instructions to their talmidim.

8) MISHNAH: There is a disagreement how one should say shmoneh esrei on a daily basis and the proper way to daven while one is traveling. The requirement to daven towards the kodosh ha-kodoshim is also mentioned.

9) The sources for having 18 brachos in shmoneh esrei are quoted.

10) How to properly bow in shmoneh esrei is presented.

11) The sources for adding a 19th brochah are cited.

12) A Beraisa tells the history of the first 18 brachos of shmoneh esrei and who composed the 19th brochah. ■

Gemara GEM

Let us not falter in our learning

ר' נחוניא בן הקנה היה מתפלל תכניסתו לבית המדרש... ולא אכשל בדבר הלכה וישמחו בי חבירי - כח:

R' Nechunya used to pray...let me not err in halachah so that my colleagues rejoice - 28b

The prayer upon entering a beis midrash was instituted by R' Nechunya ben HaKaneh. In it, a person asks that no mishap occur in his studies. He petitions that "I shall not stumble in analyzing the halachah, and that my friends will feel happy about me." Rashi explains that this request represents concern about two possible failures. First of all, if one would err by arriving at false conclusions, this is one problem. Furthermore, by committing such an error, it could cause people around him to smirk and even be entertained by his blunder. This, then, is an additional effect, caused by making the mistake, which we pray to avoid.

Maharsha, however, suggests a clear and more direct translation of this prayer. We simply are asking for one thing - that is to not make obvious blunders, or even subtle mistakes in our Torah learning. Accordingly, by always coming to a proper understanding and the true meaning of Torah, we can look forward to our fellow study partners always being pleased with our studies.

According to Maharsha, we pray for one thing - success in arriving at correct conclusions in halachah. The prayer continues by elaborating upon the wonderful outcome of this condition, namely, that our friends will be happy with us. ■

Distinctive INSIGHT

Only sincere and honest students allowed

כל תלמיד שאין תוכו כברו אל יכנס - כח.

Any student who is not sincere should not enter. - 28a

We are told that during the tenure of Rabban Gamliel as head of the academy there was a guard at the door who limited access only if a student was totally sincere and honest – תוכו כברו – the way they presented themselves outwardly was consistent with their true inner personalities.

We might wonder, who was this guard who was able to discern this character trait of each person as he aimed to enter the study hall? The Chidushei HaRim explains that the declaration of Rabban Gamliel was simply that – "the door will be the guard." Although the doors remained open, the students themselves were afraid to enter unless they felt worthy in meeting the specifications and qualifications which had been set. In this manner, only students who were genuinely motivated actually came.

The elderly Sadigerer Rebbe explained that Rabban Gamliel actually instructed that the doors to the beis midrash be locked. This stopped most students from coming. Yet, there were those who were determined to come to study, and they refused to be deterred. These

(Distinctive Insight...continued on page 2)

REVIEW and Remember

- When and how long did it take to write Masseches Eduyos ?
- According to R' Yochanan's conclusion, which should be said first, musaf or minchah ?
- When is it prohibited for a person to daven before the tzibbur ?
- What brochah did R' Yochanan b. Zakai give his students ?

HALACHA Highlight

Supporting the Chachamim

אמר רבן גמליאל: הועיל והכי הוה, איזיל ואפייסיה לרבי יהושע. כי מטא לביתיה, חזינהו לאשיתא דביתיה דמשחרן. אמר לו: מכותלי ביתך אתה ניכר שפחמי אתה. אמר לו: אוי לו לדור שאתה פרנסו, שאי אתה יודע בצערך של תלמידי חכמים במה הם מתפרנסים ובמה הם נזונים. - כח.

Rabban Gamliel said: Since this is the situation, I will go and appease Rabbi Yehoshua. When Rabban Gamliel arrived at the home of Rabbi Yehoshua, he saw that the walls of the house were soot covered. Rabban Gamliel said to Rabbi Yehoshua: From the walls of your home it is evident that you are a maker of charcoal (or smith - see Rashi¹). Rabbi Yehoshua responded: Woe to the generation that you are its patron, that you are not aware of the suffering of the scholars, by what they support and nourish themselves. - 28a

This Gemara demonstrates the persistent self-sacrifice of scholars over the ages, and other's lack of awareness of their suffering. Rabbi Shimon Duran² discusses the halachic ramifications of this story. After establishing his position that the community has the obligation to honorably support its scholars and judges, he discusses this passage. He posits that Rabbi Yehoshua must have very discreetly occupied himself in this vocation. The reason being, that an Av Beis Din (Chief Justice) such as Rabbi Yehoshua³ is forbidden to perform menial labor in the presence of three people⁴. Thus, Rabbi Yehoshua must have performed these services in a very private fashion⁵. Since the matter of Rabbi Yehoshua's supplemental occupation was not widely known, Rabban Gamliel was unaware of Rabbi Yehoshua's financial plight, because if he had been, Rabban Gamliel would have surely acted to relieve the financial burden, as he did for others⁶. Rabbi Yehoshua felt that nevertheless, Rabban Gamliel should have probed the financial

state of the scholars more fully.

However, the opinion of Rambam⁷ is that one should not receive financial support in order to continue to study. Rather, one should work, and learn Torah at every available moment. Rambam marshals support to this position from the fact that many scholars had professions and earned meager livelihoods.

This position was vigorously challenged by numerous luminaries. As previously mentioned, Rav Shimon Duran⁸ held that scholars must be supported in a worthy fashion. Further⁹, he directly addresses Rambam's view with a very detailed rebuttal. Similarly, Rav Yosef Karo in his Kesef Mishnah lengthily rejects Rambam's opinion. He writes that all the Rabbis that preceded Rambam and that followed him who held official positions were accustomed to receive support from the community. Additionally, if the scholars will not be supported, we run the risk of dispossessing the Torah. This argument is echoed by many¹⁰ of the greats. Rabbi Chaim ibn Attar¹¹ states that today, in our diminished generations one should accept support to study. Rav Moshe Feinstein¹² argues that anyone who wishes to adopt the opinion of Rambam today is succumbing to the evil inclination, and runs the risk of losing whatever he knows. ■

- 1 ד"ה שפחמי אתה 2 שו"ת תשב"ץ ח"א סי' קמב 3 ב"ק ע"ד סועיב. ועיי' כאן במהרי"ץ חיות וכן מש"כ בב"ק שם. ודו"ק 4 קידושין ע"א, רממ"ם פכ"ה מהל' סנהדרין ה"ד, שו"ע חו"מ סי' ה' ס"ד 5 עיי' בשו"ת דבר יהושע ח"ג (סי' לה אות ב', דקכ"ח ע"א) מש"כ על זה. וראה בהמשך מש"כ לתרץ 6 עיי' הוריות י' ע"א 7 פי"ג מהל' ת"ת הלי י"א. ועיי' פירוש המשניות פי"ד מאבות מ"ה. עיי' גם פי"א מהל' ת"ת ה"ט. וראה סמ"ג (מ"ע קסב) 8 שו"ת תשב"ץ שם 9 שם סי' קמז 10 מהרש"ל ב"ש"ש (פי"ג דחולין סי' ט) והב"ח והש"ך (יו"ד סי' רמו ס"ק כו) 11 ראשון לציון יו"ד סי' רמו סכ"א ובסי' חפ"ה (ברכות ע"א, דף ב' ע"ג ד"ה ואנ"י) 12 שו"ת אגרות משה ח"ב מחי"ד סי' קטז ■

STORIES off the Daf

To appreciate every moment in the beis midrash

מודה אני לפניך.. ששמת חלקי מיושבי בית המדרש ולא שמת חלקי מיושבי קרנות - כח:

I thank You...that You have granted me a place in the beis midrash, and that my place is not among those who sit [idly] in corners. - 28b

The expression here seems to be redundant. Once we thank God for allowing us to be among those who dwell in the beis midrash, it should be obvious that we are not among those who waste their time in the corners. Why is the prayer of thanks to God written in this form?

R' Chaim Kanievski, shlit"א, explains that not only do we appreciate the fact that we have the privilege of attending the beis midrash, but we are also alert to the fact that even once we enter the room in order to learn Torah, we do not sit among those who sit idly by in the corners of the beis midrash itself.

Rabbi Yehuda Zedaka, ז"ל, illustrates the way to understanding this prayer with a parable. Two people each received lump sum payments as a reward for their efforts in a certain event. One of them invested the money in the bank, and he only took funds from the earnings, leaving the principal intact. The other spent money from the principal amount. Although at the beginning they both enjoyed the freedom of spending what seemed to be unlimited funds, after just a few years one of them had nothing left, while the other had his entire fund remaining.

Here, too, among those who enter the beis midrash, everyone earns a lump sum principal as a reward. Some people do not touch that reward, and they live in this world enjoying only the fringe benefits of their Torah study. The entire קרן remains for them to enjoy in the World-to-Come. Others, however, after having spent time in the beis midrash, begin to sit in the glow of that קרן, and they eat away at the rewards they earned already now, while still in this world. Our prayer, therefore, is that we

ask God, and we express appreciation for not only being among those who dwell in the beis midrash, but also for being alert to not be among those who sit in the glow of the קרן and consume the rewards we have earned. ■

(Distinctive Insight...continued from page 1)

motivated young men managed to climb, dig or break through the simple security which had been erected around the beis midrash. As a result, only students who were zealous and enthusiastic about learning succeeded to enter.

The Gaon from Unsdorf explained that even having any type of guard at the doorway was adequate to serve the purpose. People who do not want to learn do not need too much of an excuse not to attend the session in the beis midrash. As soon as they see a guard, even if the guard will not quiz them or challenge them directly, they will turn around and go home. However, those who are resolute will not be stopped, and they will gain entry at all costs. ■