

Daf Digest for this month is dedicated in memory of רבקה יענטא (Babby Weiss) בת ר' אשר אנטשיל ע"ה

By the Weiss brothers – London, Staten Island, Yerushalayim

## OVERVIEW of the Daf

1. The Gemara concludes its discussion of the opinion of Rav Chisda who maintains that thought is not equivalent to articulation and the reason a ba'al kerai should think birkas hamazon and krias sh'ma is that they are from the Torah.

### 2. Sources for the obligation to make a brochah on Torah and food

Rav Yehudah identifies the source for making a brochah after eating and a brochah before learning.

R. Yochanan suggests with a kal vachomer that there should be a Torah obligation to make a brochah before eating and after learning but the Gemara demonstrates that there is no such obligation.

### 3. Issues related to doubtful recitations

R. Yehudah holds that where one is uncertain if he recited krias sh'ma he does not recite it again whereas by the brochah it would be recited again.

R. Elazar holds that where one is uncertain if they recited krias sh'ma it should be repeated but if one is uncertain whether they said shmone esrei it should not be repeated.

R. Yochanan disagrees and maintains that even shmone esrei should be repeated.

### 4. Two statements from Shmuel regarding davening an extra shemone esrei

If one is saying shmone esrei and he realizes that he already davened he should stop even in the middle of a brochah.

If one already davened and he enters a shul where people are davening if he cannot add something new he should not say another shmone esrei.

The Gemara explains why both statements are necessary.

### 5. Beginning shemone esrei late

Rav Huna holds that one could begin shmone esrei even if he will not finish by kedushah because kedushah could be recited by oneself. If one will not finish by modim he may not begin.

R. Yehoshua ben Levi holds that one should not begin shmone esrei if he will not finish by kedushah because according to R. Yehoshua ben Levi kedushah may not be recited by oneself.

The Gemara questions interrupting shmone esrei for the recitation of "יהא שמו הגדול מבורך" and the conclusion is that one does not interrupt.

### 6. Clarification of R' Yehudah's opinion regarding a ba'al kerai

The Gemara explains that R. Yehudah permits a ba'al kerai to recite brachos because he uses the source for the prohibition for a different droshoh.

R. Yehudah's position as presently understood is questioned from a later Mishnah which shows that even according to R. Yehudah a ba'al kerai should not make brachos. ■

## Distinctive INSIGHT

### To interrupt during prayer

מהו להפסיק ליהא שמו הגדול מבורך - כב.

May one interrupt to say "Yehei Shmei Rabbah"? - 22b

A person may not interrupt to answer קדושה or יהא שמייה while in the middle of shmoneh esrei. Yet, the Gemara asks whether one may interrupt at that point to answer קדושה. The answer reported by R' Dimi is that it is permitted to respond to ישיר, because, he explains, one may even interrupt if he is immersed in the study of מעשה מרכבה.

The Gemara concludes, however, that the halachah is not according to the statement of R' Dimi. שלייה understands the Gemara to mean that the halachah does not accord with R' Dimi on either account. We cannot interrupt during שמוייע nor during the study of the מרכבה to answer ישיר. Mateh Moshe (#66) however, understands that although it is true that we are not allowed to interrupt שמוייע, someone immersed in מעשה מרכבה can stop and call out ישיר.

According to Mateh Moshe, the Gemara argues with R' Dimi on two points. First of all, we do not allow one to interrupt שמוייע to say יהא שמייה רבה. Secondly, R' Dimi assumed that disrupting מעשה מרכבה is more severe than interrupting during עשרה. We hold the opposite, and that one may interrupt the study of esoteric and mystical topics to respond and call out יהא שמייה רבה, but it is not allowed to do so while in the middle of one's עשרה. ■

## Gemara GEM

### The basis of prayer: Rambam and Ramban

אלא קריאת שמע וברכת המזון דאורייתא ותפילה דרבנן - כב.

Krias Sh'ma and birkas hamazone are Torah laws, prayer is rabbinic. - 22a

There is a famous discussion among the Rishonim regarding the nature of the obligation we all have to daven.

Ramban (Sefer HaMitzvos #5) writes that the basic mitzvah to daven is only rabbinic. This is also the opinion of most poskim. Rambam writes that the obligation to daven is a Torah-level mitzvah, but the precise times and the exact words which we use are rabbinic guidelines. Some understand that, according to Rambam, the basic structure of our daily amidah, with the praises of Hashem placed first, followed by our personal needs and concluding with gratitude, is also Torah legislated. Even according to Rambam, the Torah obligation can be discharged once daily, and the elaboration and complete arrangement to daven three times each day is rabbinic.

One of the major proofs for Ramban is our Gemara, where a ba'al kerai cannot daven even with הרהור – concentrated thought – as he is allowed to do when reciting sh'ma and birkas hamazon, which are Torah level obligations. Obviously, Ramban claims, we see that

# HALACHA Highlight

## Kedushah With A Minyan

וכן אמר רב אדא בר אהבה: מנין שאין היחיד אומר קדושה – שנאמר: (ויקרא כב, לב) ונקדשתי בתוך בני ישראל – כל דבר שבקדושה לא יהא פחות מעשרה - כב:

Rav Ada bar Ahava similarly said: From where do we derive that an individual may not say Kedushah in the absence of a quorum? We learn it from the verse: 'And I will be sanctified amongst the Jewish people'. All matters of holiness (דבר שבקדושה) may not be recited with less than ten. - 22b

There are three points in the prayer when Kedushah is recited:

1) In the blessing of Yotzer Ohr (קדושת יוצר) 2) In the repetition of the Amidah, and 3) In U'Va LiTzion (קדושה דסדרא). The Poskim disagree in defining the Kedushah that one may not say without a quorum. There is consensus that the Kedushah of the repetition of the Amidah must be said with a quorum. The points in contention are the Kedushah of Yotzer Ohr and the Kedushah of U'Va LiTzion. Some<sup>1</sup> hold that this limitation applies to each time Kedushah is said, and therefore an individual not praying with a quorum would be required to skip these points. Others<sup>2</sup> hold that this restriction applies only to the Kedushah recited during the repetition of the Amidah. Some<sup>3</sup> distinguish between the Kedushah of Yotzer Ohr that may not be said by the individual, and the Kedushah of U'Va LiTzion that may. Some<sup>4</sup> say that the individual may always say the Kedushah if it is recited as one reads the Scripture with the appropriate cantillation (טעמים).

Shulchan Aruch<sup>5</sup> presents two views: that Kedushah of Yotzer Ohr may and may not be said by the individual. He con-

# REVIEW and Remember

1. What is the source for making a brochah before studying Torah?
2. Why is krias sh'ma a better way to fulfill zechiras yetzias mitzrayim than the brochah following sh'ma?
3. How do we know that devarim shebikedusha require a minyan?
4. What two drashos did R' Yehoshua ben Levi make from the juxtaposition of the psukim about teaching children and the event of ma'amad har Sinai?

cludes by stating that one should respect the view that Kedushah not be said by an individual, and therefore the individual should say the Kedushah of Yotzer Ohr with cantillation (טעמים). Rema<sup>6</sup> states that the prevalent custom is that the individual does say the Kedushah of Yotzar alone. However, Mishneh Berurah<sup>7</sup> states that an individual should preferably try to say the Kedushah of Yotzer Ohr with cantillation (טעמים). ■

1 שבלי הלקט (סי' יג) בשם קדמונים רבים. סי' המנהיג (סי' לא), עמי סג וסי' עו, עמי קו), שו"ת הרשב"א (ח"ה סי' ט'). ועי' ח"א סי' ז'. 2 תלמידי רבינו יונה (כאן, דף יג ע"א בדפי הר"ף) בשם רבנו צרפת ומקצת הגאונים, ושכן נוטה דעת רבינו יונה. רא"ש (פ"ג סי' יח ומגילה פ"ג סי' ז'), והמאירי (ברכות כא ע"ב וע"י מגילה כג ע"ב), וכן נראה דעת הטור (סי' נט). 3 ר"ן (מגילה כג ע"ב, דף יג ע"ב בדפי הר"ף ד"ה שמעין), ובפירוש ריבב"ן (ברכות מה ע"ב, עמי קעו בדפ"ה"ס) 4 שו"ת ר"י מגאש (סי' קלא) ושו"ת תרומת הדשן (סי' ח). ועי' בשו"ת הרשב"א ח"א (סי' ז) וח"ה (סי' ט') שיושבים בסת"ר. ועי' ישוב בהערות במהדי מכון ירושלים ח"ה שם. 5 סי' נט סי"ג 6 שם 7 שם סי"ק יא ■

# STORIES off the Daf

## Timeless Torah

ברכת התורה לפני ולפניה ולאחריה - כא.

The brochah for learning Torah, before and after study. - 21a

HaGaon Rabbi Elazar Min Schach, zt"l, once mentioned to a group of his close talmidim that he was always bothered by a question of the Pnei Yehoshua, but he was not sure whether they would be bothered by the same problem. The students wondered if they could come up with an answer to the question, but HaRav Schach repeated that it was the question that bothered him, not the answer.

When their curiosity had peaked, the

Rosh HaYeshiva asked them the query. The Gemara says that there is a brochah to be said before one learns Torah, and there is also discussion about the blessing to be recited upon finishing learning. Now, regarding saying a brochah beforehand, we can certainly understand that this is reasonable. However, asks the Pnei Yehoshua, what is the situation where one has finished learning? The obligation to learn is day and night, and there is no time in one's entire life when one can claim that his learning has come to an end!

"Now," concluded HaRav Schach, "many of you watch the clock, and when the study period is over, you close your Gemara. That is when the learning has ended. The Torah of a true ben-Torah, however, is not fixed by the clock. He is

immersed and driven to climb the ladder of ascent and growth as a life goal. For him, there is no moment when the brochah after learning can apply. This is the question of the Pnei Yehoshua." ■

(Gemara Gem...Continued from page 1)

prayer is distinct in that it is only rabbinic. Magen Avraham (101:#2) explains that Rambam would say that even though prayer is mid'oraisa, a ba'al kerai could fulfill his obligation to pray as he reviews birkas hamazon, which has praises and requests contained within it. This is why the Gemara does not entertain the possibility of a ba'al kerai davening by means of hirhur.

Reb Chaim (on Rambam, Hilchos Tefilla 4:1) explains that even according to Ramban who holds that the obligation (חייב) to daven in the first place is only a rabbinic requirement, when one prays he is definitely fulfilling (קיום) a Torah mitzvah. ■