

Daf Digest for this month is dedicated in memory of רבקה יענטא (Babby Weiss) בת ר' אשר אנטשיל ע"ה

By the Weiss brothers – London, Staten Island, Yerushalayim

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) Why earlier generations experienced more miracles than did later generations

R' Papa asked Abaye why earlier generations experienced greater miracles while later generations were more accomplished in learning. Abaye answered that earlier generations practiced greater mesirus nefesh than later generations.

2) Two stories about Amoraim sitting by the mikveh

Rav Gidal would sit by the mikveh instructing women how to immerse and wasn't worried about having improper thoughts because he saw the women as white geese.

R' Yochanan sat by the mikveh so that the women coming out would see him and have children as beautiful as he was. He was not worried about עין הרע because he was among the descendants of Yosef who are not subject to עין הרע.

3) MISHNAH: The obligation of women, slaves and children in various mitzvos is recorded

4) The Gemara explains why it was necessary to state each halachah in the Mishnah

5) The obligation for women to recite kiddush

Since women are obligated in the prohibitions of Shabbos they are obligated in its positive mitzvos, including kiddush.

6) The obligation of women to recite birkas hamazon

Ravina asks Rava whether women's obligation to recite birkas hamazon is from the Torah or perhaps their obligation is only Rabbinic. The question remains unresolved.

7) Why the Jews are worthy of special attention

Rav Avira explains that God gives special attention to the Jews because they are careful to recite birkas hamazon after eating even a k'zayis.

8) MISHNAH: The obligation of a ba'al keri in various brachos is recorded.

9) Is thought the same as articulation?

Ravina deduces from our Mishnah that thinking a brochah is the same as articulating the brochah. Rav Chisda disagrees. ■

REVIEW and Remember

1. What halachos did R' Yehudah find to be particularly difficult?
.....
2. In the merit of what act did Yosef merit protection from עין הרע ?
.....
3. Why are women obligated to daven if it is a time bound mitzvah ?
.....
4. Why is it important to know whether a woman's obligation in birkas hamazon is from the Torah or Rabbinic?
.....

Distinctive INSIGHT

Women's obligation to bentch

נשים בברכת המזון מדאורייתא או מדרבנן - כ :

Is women's obligation in birkas hamazon from the Torah or is it rabbinic? - 20b

Ravina asked Rava whether a woman's obligation to recite birkas hamazon is from the Torah or by rabbinic enactment. Being that birkas hamazon is a positive mitzvah that is not time related it is difficult to understand why women should not be obligated to recite birkas hamazon mid'oraissa. Rashi explains that since the posuk that commands us to recite birkas hamazon also says "For the good land which He gave you," and women were not given a portion of the land of Israel, the mitzvah is not incumbent upon them. Tosafos finds this explanation unacceptable, being that kohanim and leviim also were not given any land as an inheritance, and according to Rashi they should be excluded from the mitzvah as well. It is worthwhile to note that the Shiltei Giborim explicitly states that according to Rashi, kohanim and leviim would be in the same category as women for this mitzvah.

Tosafos offers a different explanation, namely, the reason to exempt women from birkas hamazon is that while bentching one must say, "for the covenant which you engraved into our flesh and for Your Torah that You have taught us," and women who are not obligated in the mitzvos of bris milah and Torah study. This could therefore be the reason they are exempt from the Torah obligation to recite birkas hamazon.

Magen Avrohom (O.C. 186:#1), in defense of Rashi, explains that although kohanim and leviim were not given the land as an inheritance, they were, nonetheless, given parcels of land in which to live, namely the forty-eight Levite cities. Accordingly, it is still appropriate for them to give thanks for the good land which they received. This answer is also not complete. The Mishnah in Ma'aser Sheni (5:14) states that kohanim are obligated to bring bikkurim to the Beis HaMikdash but they do not read the parasha that normally accompanies the mitzvah. The reason they do not recite the parasha as others would is that they do not own a portion of the land and are not legally allowed to make the declarations contained in the reading. If Magen Avrohom is correct, that we consider the Levite cities to be their inheritance, they should be obligated to read the parasha of bikkurim the same as everyone else.

Aruch HaShulchan suggests another distinction between women and kohanim and leviim. Although kohanim and leviim were not given a portion of the land they are nonetheless beneficiaries of the land in the form of terumah and ma'aser. The obligation incumbent upon others to give terumah and ma'aser to kohanim and leviim makes it appropriate for them to say "על הארץ הטובה אשר נתן" even though they do not own any land. ■

HALACHA Highlight

The obligation for women to daven

נשים ועבדים וקטנים... וחייבין בתפילה. וחייבין בתפלה דרחמי ניהו. – מהו דתימא: הואיל וכתביב בה (תהלים נה, יח) ערב בקר וצהרים, כמצות עשה שהזמן גרמא דמי – קמשמע לן. - כ:

“Women, slaves and children are obligated in prayer” - They are obligated in prayer because prayer is a request for Divine compassion, and everyone requires that. I may have thought that since it is written as regards prayer 'evening and morning and afternoon', possibly prayer has the status of a Mitzvah that is bound by time and thus they would be exempt. Therefore, the Mishnah comes to inform me that women are obligated. - 20b

The Poskim agree that women have an obligation of daily prayer. However, the scope of that obligation is a point in contention. It is the opinion of Rashi¹ and others² that prayer is an obligation of Rabbinic origin (דרבנן). On the other hand, the Rambam³ and others⁴ opine that prayer is of Torah origin (דאורייתא), and the Rabbis further defined that obligation by instituted times, language etc.

Meiri⁵ writes that the different views can possibly be linked to different versions in the text of this Gemara. Rambam may have had a version of the Gemara, cited fully in Tosafos⁶, that states as follows:

“בתפילה. פשיטא! כיון דכתיב ערב ובקר וצהרים אשיחה ואמהה כמצות עשה שהזמן גרמא הוי, קמ”ל דרחמי ניהו”

They are also obligated in prayer. Isn't this obvious? I may have thought that since the verse states 'evening, morning and afternoon I will speak and pray to God maybe it has the status of a time-bound positive commandment. Therefore, we are told that prayer is a request for com-

passion (and is not time-bound). The outcome being that prayer is a mitzvah of Torah origin, but is not time-bound.

Our version appears to conform to Rashi's view that prayer is Rabbinically prescribed, since the Gemara states that reason for prayer being incumbent upon women is that women are in need of compassion, and not that it is not a time-bound mitzvah.

Shulchan Aruch⁸ rules like Rambam that women are obligated in prayer because it is a Torah commandment that is not time-bound, whereas Rema seems to follow the view of Rashi that a woman's responsibility in prayer is Rabbinic.⁹ One of the practical differences between these two views is the number of prayers that a woman must pray.¹⁰ Shulchan Aruch who rules that prayer is a Torah obligation without time restrictions would hold that one amidah a day would be enough. Rema would likely hold that a woman would be obligated to pray Shacharis and Minchah. ■

- 1 ד"ה הכי גרסינן. ועוד לעיל יז ע"ב (ד"ה ואלו ואלו)
- 2 ר"ח (כ"ע"ב ועוד כא ע"א), תוס' (סוטה לב ע"א ד"ה ק"ש). [נועי תוס' ברכות כ ע"ב ד"ה בתפלה], רמב"ן בהשגות לשה"מ (ה"ע ה'), שו"ב הרשב"א ח"א (ס"א צ)
- 3 פ"א בה"ת תפלה ה"א, ובסה"מ (מ"ע ה')
- 4 ה"ר א"ה לרברכות (י ע"ב) ובשו"ת הריטב"א (ס"י צז, עמ' עמ' ק"ז). וע"י ס' החינוך (מצוה תלג).
- 5 כאן (עמ' 96). אמנם השווה לרבינו יונה כאן (דף יא סו"ע"ב בדפי הרי"ף) בדעת הרי"ף
- 6 כאן ד"ה בתפלה
- 7 ולכן רש"י העדיף גירסא זו, וכן ר"ח כאן. אמנם ע"י בתוס' כאן (ד"ה בתפלה) שדחה הראיה
- 8 ס"י קו ס"ב
- 9 ע"י פרמ"ג (ס"י קו בא"א ס"ק ב')
- 10 ע"י מג"א (ס"י קו ס"ק ב') ובפרמ"ג שם (א"א ס"ק ב'). וכן פסק במשנ"ב (שם ס"ק ד) ■

STORIES off the Daf

Preparing for Kiddush Hashem

מאי שנא ראשונים דאתרחיש להו ניסא, ומאי שנא אנן דלא מתרחיש לן ניסא? - כ.

Why did miracles occur to earlier generations, but they do not happen to us? - 20a

The Chasam Sofer was the Chief Rabbi of Hungary. The rabbi in the town of Pesing officiated over the conversion of a fine young man, and when the milah was performed, the bleeding would not stop. The convert was suffering quite a bit, and his life was in danger. The people could not summon a doctor, however, because it was absolutely forbidden to convert any of the citizens of the coun-

try to Judaism without government approval, which the rabbi had not secured. The Jews of the community were terrified, for if this man would die, and the government would find out what happened, all the Jews in the area would be in grave danger.

The rabbi quickly traveled to the Chasam Sofer to ask for advice. After careful deliberation, and in consideration of the imminent danger to hundreds of Jewish families, it was decided that the rabbi and the convert had to go to the Danube River and jump in. They would perish על קידוש השם, and their bodies would be forever swept away by the river and its swift and raging currents. As they approached the river, prepared to accept their fate, an old man met them on the

road. He asked them why they were so walking in such a dangerous place. After a short exchange, the rabbi revealed their mission, when the old man told him that he was an experienced mohel, who had been present at numerous bris milos. He had some special dirt which was medicinal, which he used, and the bleeding stopped. The man then disappeared. The rabbi and the convert then understood that they had met none other than Eliyahu.

When the Chasam Sofer heard the story, he immediately referred to our Gemara, and pointed out how their willingness to offer their lives for Kiddush Hashem earned them this heavenly assistance. ■

