

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) Responding to heresy (cont.)

Four exchanges between R' Gamliel and a heretic are recorded.

Two exchanges with heretics, one involving Ameimar and the other with R' Tanchum, are presented before citing another exchange between R' Gamliel and a heretic.

Other exchanges between a sage and a heretic are retold.

R' Elazar explains when Hashem is good to all and when He is good to the righteous.

2) Rejoicing at the downfall of the wicked

R' Acha bar Chanina cites a pasuk that indicates that Hashem rejoiced at the death of Achav .

The assertion that Hashem rejoices at the downfall of the wicked is unsuccessfully challenged.

Verses related to the death of Achav are cited and expounded.

3) Ovadiah

Different expositions are cited that describe the greatness of Ovadiah.

4) Meisha, king of Moav

Rav and Shmuel disagree about Meisha, king of Moav's intent when he offered his son as a sacrifice.

The opinion that maintains that Meisha's intent was for idolatry is unsuccessfully challenged.

Two additional expositions are presented. ■

הדרן עלך אחד דיני ממונות

REVIEW and Remember

1. How did R' Gamliel respond to the heretic who accused Hashem of being a thief?

2. Why did the heretic assume that Hashem is a kohen?

3. Does Hashem rejoice at the downfall of wicked people?

4. Why did Meisha, king of Moav, sacrifice his son?

Today's Daf Digest is dedicated
 In loving memory of
 מרת איטא בת חיים וחנה ע"ה
 Mrs. Edith Levee

Distinctive INSIGHT

A time to sing, and a time for praise

באותה שעה בקשו מלאכי השרת לומר שירה לפני הקב"ה. אמר להן הקב"ה מעשה ידי טובעין ביים ואתם אומרים שירה?

Rav Shmuel b. Nachman said in the name of R' Yonasan that when the Egyptians were drowning in the sea, the ministering angels wanted to recite a song of praise in the presence of Hashem. Hashem said to them: "My handiwork is drowning in the sea and you recite a song [of praise] before Me?"

The heavenly angels learned their lesson that it was inappropriate for them to sing praise as the Egyptians were destroyed. Yet, at the same time, the Jewish people themselves were, in fact, permitted and encouraged to sing the famous song of the sea as their enemies perished.

This dichotomy, where the angels are not allowed to sing praise while the Jewish nation is expected to do exactly that, also surfaces in a parallel exchange which is described in the Gemara (Rosh HaShana 32b). There, the angels wonder to Hashem why the Jews do not sing Hallel on Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur. Hashem explains to the angels that Hallel cannot be sung while the Book of the Living and the Dead is open and people's fate hangs in the balance. Here, again, we may wonder, why did the angels only ask about the failure of the Jews to sing Hallel? Why don't we find them seeking to sing praise, only to find Hashem correcting them and silencing them as He did by the Red Sea? The answer is that the angels had already learned their lesson earlier. They realized that when Hashem brings justice upon the world, they, the angels, are to remain silent. However, they wondered only why the Jews had to remain quiet on the Days of Judgment, although they were allowed to sing to Hashem at the Red Sea. After all, on Rosh HaShana the Jews wear white garments and they approach the day with a sense of trepidation blended with hopeful optimism. This would call for Hallel to be said.

Aruch Laner explains that nevertheless, Hashem answered the angels and explained that although the Jews trust that Hashem will judge them with compassion and mercy, it is still not proper for them to sing while the King sits on His throne and the final verdict on people's lives hangs in the balance. Their trust in Hashem that things will be for the best is not enough of a basis for the recital of Hallel. As the verse states (Tehillim 99:5), "I have trusted in Your kindness; may my heart rejoice in Your salvation." The verse then concludes: "I will sing to Hashem when He has granted kindness to me." The time to sing is only after salvation is delivered. ■

HALACHAH Highlight

Why there is no beracha before reading Parshas Zachor

מעשה ידי טובעין בים ואתם אומרים שירה לפני

My handiwork is drowning in the sea and you want to sing a song in My presence?

Many later authorities question why a beracha is not recited when we read Parshas Zachor since according to most opinions it is a fulfillment of the mitzvah to eradicate the memory of Amalek. Kaf Hachaim¹ cites authorities who answer that we do not recite a beracha on destruction even when it is the destruction of our enemies. Proof to this principle is found in our Gemara. When the Egyptians were drowning in the sea the Ministering Angels wanted to sing a song of praise of Hashem and He rebuked them with the question, "My handiwork is drowning at sea and you want to sing a song?"

Teshuvos Mishnah Halachos² challenged this explanation from the simple fact that Bnei Yisroel sang a song of praise and it was only the Angels that Hashem rebuked. Teshuvos L'horos Nosson³ also points out that following the reading of the megilla we say והמשלם גמול לכל אויבי – and He punishes all the enemies of our souls.

ברוך אתה ה' הנפרע לעמו – Blessed are You Hashem who repays the Jewish People from all of their enemies. Both of the phrases indicate that it is acceptable to make a beracha on the destruction of our enemies.

Mishnah Halachos suggests that the reason a beracha is not recited is that the mitzvah is not confined to time. The mitzvah to recall Amalek is a constant mitzvah and as such there is no beracha recited on the mitzvah as we find by other constant mitzvos that we do not recite a beracha before fulfilling that mitzvah. L'horos Nosson proposes that the function of a beracha is to bring to our consciousness that the act of the mitzvah should be done in fulfillment of the obligation. Thus, for example, a beracha is recited before donning tefillin to serve as a reminder that the tefillin are to be donned for the sake of the mitzvah. The mitzvah of reading Parshas Amalek is fundamentally different since the reading of the parsha reminds us of the mitzvah that we are to perform, namely, eradicating the memory of Amalek. There is no need to recite a beracha since the reading of the parsha serves the purpose of a beracha, i.e. to remind us to do the mitzvah for the sake of the mitzvah. ■

1. כף החיים או"ח סי' תרפ"ה ס"ק כ"ט.
2. שו"ת משנה הלכות ח"ז סי' פ"א.
3. שו"ת להורות נתן ח"ה סי' מ"ז. ■

STORIES Off the Daf

The Minyan

"כל בי עשרה שכינתא שריה..."

Rav Yaakov of Amshinov, zt"l, worked to fulfill the mitzvah of pidyon shevuyim. Once, he returned home at an inordinately late hour. It was so late that when he sought a minyan to daven Maariv, it was hard to find anyone who still hadn't prayed.

Completely nonplussed, the Rebbe ordered his gabbai to go to the local hangout. Any Jews in there would likely not have davened maariv—perhaps not for many long weeks or months! Sure enough the gabbai found several Jews there whom he convinced to complete the minyan.

Most of them were so divorced from Yiddishkeit that the gabbai had to provide some kind of head covering so that they could join the minyan.

When the Admor of Amshinov from America, zt"l, told this story he would conclude. "We find in Sanhedrin 39 that the Divine presence rests with ten Jews. Even if they are completely wicked, if they join a minyan to daven, the Shechinah rests upon them."¹

A similar thing happened in the famous Zichron Moshe shtiebel in Yerushalayim. Known for having a minyan even at very late hours, several very busy Jews found that there is no guarantee of a minyan at all times. When they poured out their heart to Rav Gutfarb, the gabbai, he presented a very simple solution to their prob-

lem. He dialed a local cab company which only employed Jewish drivers and ordered a whole bunch of taxis. When they got there he met them and asked them to put on a kipah, turn on the meter, and join the minyan in prayer. There were exactly enough drivers to make up a minyan and after a very enthusiastic davening Rav Gutfarb asked them what he owed them for the privilege of making a minyan. Not one driver would take a penny. Instead they thanked him. One remarked that perhaps they owed him.

"Do you know how long it's been since I have been in a shul...?"² ■

1. ימות עולם, ע"י כ"ו
2. כן שמעתי ■